Exploring the Cultural Dimensions of Sustainability

Traditionally, sustainability has largely been defined at the global and national level, but more recently it has been applied to cities and communities too. This shift in focus is reinforced, in part, through the adoption of sustainability frameworks and concerns by the community development field. Parallel to this “local turn” is a greater appreciation for culture as a significant component of sustainability.

Cultural considerations in community development often emerge through discussions about social sustainability or community capital. The pattern is similar: community sustainability continues to be most commonly seen as a way to improve a community’s “well-being” in social, economic, and environmental terms, with culture gradually forming a part of this vision.

This edition of Creative City News offers a taste of some of the evolving concepts around sustainable community development where culture is a significant component. These concepts overlap and inform one another in organic and co-evolutionary ways. For instance, discussions of sustainability incorporate both social and cultural ideas, and community development practices include sustainable community development and community cultural development. Cultural and social capital are part of both sustainability and community development, and eco-arts practices influence thinking about relationships between culture and the environment. As well, the different areas are often linked in practice through a number of common values and approaches.

More and more, culture is a key topic in discussions of sustainability—one with the potential to transform communities and individuals in positive and meaningful ways over the long term.

Our culture embodies the sense we make of our lives; it is built on the values we share and the ways we come to terms with our differences; it deals with what matters to people and communities: relationships, memories, experiences, identities, backgrounds, hopes and dreams in all their diversity. And most of all, our culture expresses our visions of the future: what it is we want to pass on to future generations.

Our culture connects our present with our pasts and with the future we imagine. It is with culture that we make the connections, the networks of meanings and values, and of friendship and interest, that hold us together in time, in place and in society.

Our culture describes the ways we tell each other our stories, how we create our sense of ourselves, how we remember who we are, how we imagine who we want to become, how we relax, how we celebrate, how we argue, how we bring up our children, the spaces we make for ourselves.

Our culture is the expression of our desires to be happy, our desires to belong, our desires to survive and, above all, our desires to be creative.

— Jon Hawkes, Understanding Culture, 2003

For more information and profiles of cultural projects making a difference in Canadian communities, visit www.creativecity.ca

In recognition of the rapidly growing importance of cultural development for communities of all sizes, the Creative City Network of Canada is proud to continue its partnership with the Federation of Canadian Municipalities to inform elected officials about the benefits of a strong creative community, and how to build that strength.
The four-pillar model of sustainability

In 2001, Jon Hawkes, a cultural analyst and one of Australia’s leading commentators on cultural policy, wrote *The Fourth Pillar of Sustainability: Culture’s Essential Role in Public Planning*. His book incorporates four interlinked dimensions: environmental responsibility, economic health, social equity, and cultural vitality. Hawkes addresses the need for a cultural perspective in public planning and policy by proposing practical measures for integration. In order for public planning to be more effective, Hawkes argues that government must develop a framework that evaluates the cultural impacts of environmental, economic, and social decisions and plans currently being implemented in cities and communities.

His four-pillar model recognizes that a community’s vitality and quality of life is closely related to the vitality and quality of its cultural engagement, expression, dialogue, and celebration. This model further demonstrates that the contribution of culture to building lively cities and communities where people want to live, work, and visit plays a major role in supporting social and economic health. The key to cultural sustainability is fostering partnerships, exchange, and respect between different streams of government, business, and arts organizations. Culture as the fourth pillar promotes these partnerships and is quickly gaining currency in policy and planning initiatives in Canada, Australia, New Zealand, and Europe.

Four well-beings of community sustainability

New Zealand’s Ministry for Culture and Heritage created a well-being model that includes cultural, environmental, social, and economic dimensions. The model was created in response to Local Government Act 2002 (Section 10), which states that local government is responsible for promoting “the social, economic, environmental, and cultural well-being of communities, in the present and for the future.” Through this model, the Ministry emphasizes the necessity for councils to deal with all four types of well-being in order to achieve sustainable development. Similar to the other models, this one sees the different forms of well-being as interconnected. Overall well-being, which it places at the centre, is enhanced when all four areas are given equal weight, are interdependent, and are able to move efficiently around the centre.

Cultural well-being is the vitality that communities and individuals enjoy through:
- participation in recreation, creative and cultural activities; and
- the freedom to retain, interpret and express their arts, history, heritage and traditions.


The medicine wheel approach to sustainability

Nathan Cardinal and Emilie Adin’s *An urban Aboriginal life: The 2005 indicators report on the quality of life of Aboriginal people in the Greater Vancouver region* uses the medicine wheel as a framework to determine categories and indicators for exploring and documenting the state of Aboriginal life in and around Vancouver.

The medicine wheel depicts four traditional directions: north (environmental), south (social), west (economic), and east (cultural). This represents culture and family because in Aboriginal tradition beginnings start in the east, which is where the sun rises and a new dawn begins.

Four key segments of Aboriginal society—male, female, children and youth, and adults and elders—crosscut the four elements. Each of these segments is considered to be critical to give context to the Aboriginal community’s overall well-being. Cardinal and Adin explain that a holistic and flexible planning and development process surrounds the medicine wheel, guiding the framework’s development and maintenance.
**Sustainability**

Sustainability is fundamentally about adapting to a new ethic of living on the planet and creating a more equitable and just society through the fair distribution of social goods and resources. Sustainable development questions consumption-based lifestyles and decision-making processes that are based solely upon economic efficiency, but its ethical underpinnings go beyond obligation to the environment and the economy—it is a holistic and creative process towards which we must constantly strive. This is complicated by the fact that sustainable development is based on society’s always changing worldviews and values.

Environmental, social, and economic models of sustainability view culture as an important dimension, yet there is still a general lack of understanding of what culture relates to and contributes. To date, culture has traditionally been viewed as a component of the social dimensions of sustainability or as part of discussions on social capital, and has largely been unexamined. In part, the issue is a lack of recognition of cultural considerations as such. For instance, the intertwined origin of cultural and social sustainability dimensions is illustrated by L.S. Bourne who uses the term social sustainability to describe “the conditions needed for the survival of identifiable ethnocultural groups” including “processes of cultural reproduction.”

**Socially sustainable communities are able to:**
- achieve and maintain personal health: physical, mental and physiological;
- feed themselves adequately;
- provide adequate and appropriate shelter for themselves;
- have opportunities for gainful and meaningful employment;
- improve their knowledge and understanding of the world around them;
- find opportunities to express creativity and enjoy recreation in ways that satisfy spiritual and psychological needs;
- express a sense of identity through heritage, art and culture;
- enjoy a sense of belonging;
- be assured of mutual social support from their community;
- enjoy freedom from discrimination and, for those who are physically challenged, move about a barrier-free community;
- enjoy freedom from fear, and security of person; and
- participate actively in civic affairs.

**Both social sustainability and cultural development ...**
- Teach about all aspects of sustainability in schools, universities, and communities
- Build community capital
- See art and culture as an educational tool
- Encourage organizations to work together on poverty, job development, housing, health, redevelopment, and youth concerns in communities
- Support local development initiatives
- Increase social inclusion and build stronger communities
- Improve quality of life, sense of place, and well-being in communities
- Relate to rural and urban revitalization
- Improve the physical environment, such as parks, and revitalize buildings
- Support affordable housing (for example, artist cooperatives)
- Improve street life, which improves social relations in neighbourhoods
- Provide healthy and supportive communities for youth
- Improve cultural facilities in order to improve community cohesion
Cultural sustainability / Cultural capital

Culture is gradually emerging out of the realm of social sustainability and is being recognized as having a separate, distinct, and integral role in sustainable development. In 1995, UNESCO defined the cultural dimension of community development as being “the whole complex of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features that characterize a society or social group. It includes not only the arts and letters, but also modes of life, the fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions and beliefs.” Cultural sustainability means change occurs in a way that respects cultural values. Discussions of sustainability must include an understanding of culture as well as of the place in which it occurs, so that community and geographic context is not ignored. Serious discussions of sustainability require detailed exploration of the particular complexities of each situation, and preservation of the environment and of culture must be balanced with considerations of current practices.

Related to this is important research that links markers of cultural continuity in First Nations communities with their rates of teenage suicide. Michael Chandler and Christopher Lalonde, in a June 1998 article in Transcultural Psychiatry, note the lower youth suicide rates in communities that actively preserve and rehabilitate their own cultures. Within the sustainability field, culture is often discussed in terms of cultural capital, which goes beyond arts and heritage to encompass diverse traditions, values, place, and social history. The stock of cultural capital, both tangible and intangible, is what we inherit from past generations and what we will pass onto future generations. Overall, it leads to quality of life and better knowledge of ourselves.

From a policy perspective, the Government of Canada, Agenda 21 for Culture, and UNESCO’s Decade for Education for Sustainable Development (2005-2014) encompass cultural development as related to social policy and goals such as fostering social inclusion, cultural diversity, rural diversity, rural revitalization, public housing, health, ecological preservation and sustainable development.

Community development

Community development aims to strengthen the economy and the social ties within a community through locally based initiatives. The community development process is often characterized as a “triple bottom line” of amalgamating environmental, social, and economic well-being into a common audit. The bottom line is now expanding to include cultural well-being and good governance.

The central goals of community development rely on residents having the ability to express their values, be self-reliant, satisfy basic human needs, and have greater participation and accountability in their community. This is accomplished by education, citizen participation, consensus building, and access to information. Creating a sense of place in the community is central as it empowers residents to become decision-makers over their own environment, resources, and future.

Community development empowers communities to position local issues within a larger political context. An important aspect of community development is that it is not handed down from experts or governments. Although community development strategies differ in their focus and approach from community to community, the underlying goal is to improve the quality of life of residents. According to the Centre for Sustainable Development at Simon Fraser University, approaches to community development include: identifying community challenges, locating local resources, analyzing local power structures and human needs, and acting on residents’ concerns in the community.

Sustainable community development

Community sustainability goes beyond environmental practices and economic growth: it is about creating a more just and equitable community through encouraging social and cultural diversity. It also requires the community to define sustainability from its own values and perspective. This involves community participation and a collective decision-making process that meets the social, cultural, environmental, and economic needs of the community.

Sustainable community development is a process of developing a local and self-reliant economy that does not damage the world’s ecosystem or the social well-being of communities. Residents in sustainable communities aim to combine policies and programs that satisfy multiple objectives.

...while there has been much written in recent years about social capital, there has been comparatively little said about cultural capital. Yet the arts, the food, the music and the values that lie beneath these are of profound importance in bringing people together.

— Matthew Pile, quoted in Tom Borrup’s Toward asset-based community cultural development: A journey through the disparate worlds of community building 2013

Cultural sustainability / Cultural capital

...community development begins at the everyday lives of local people. This is the initial context of sustainable change.

— Margaret Ledwith, Community development A critical approach 2005

...sustainability is reflected in the capacity of the community to cope with change and adapt to new situations.

— Warren Williams, Sustainable development and social sustainability 2010
Community capital

During the 1990s, as sustainability became a central force in community development, the field increasingly focused on building the local capacity of an area in order to create more environmentally friendly and socially equitable places to live. In the course of this work, and informed by Robert Putnam and others interested in community capital and participation, scholars and policymakers increasingly embraced the idea that this process depends on increasing a community’s available stock of social capital, and became more concerned with social capital formation. Today, professionals and academics in the field consider sustainable community development to be an appreciation of many types of community capital and/or assets within a community. For example, Simon Fraser University’s Centre for Sustainable Community Development considers community capital to include natural, physical, economic, human, social, and cultural forms of capital.

Community cultural development

Community cultural development, considered as part of an emerging sustainability framework, encompasses a variety of activities involving individuals expressing their own stories, engaging in skill-building, and actively developing their culture. Using arts and culture as a tool, community cultural development can help the community develop appropriate models of sustainability. As with other sustainable development models, there is no one model, but it is important in all cases that the relationship between artists and their community is an equal one, where creative collaboration fosters social development and change.

Largely seen as a grassroots strategy, community cultural development is slowly being incorporated into current development models. It engages artists and cultural organizations in development and revitalization processes in cities and communities. It lends itself to sustainability planning through supporting a community culture, empowering residents, and strengthening cultural infrastructure and participation in a community. Community cultural development has also been linked to other sustainable community development initiatives, such as health, affordable housing, education, youth, poverty, education, policy, and planning. Having a cultural lens in all these areas is an emerging component of sustainable development.

An important aspect of community cultural development is the concept of shared culture, which entails having a mutual respect for every culture in a community. Through this collective experience, communities gain respect for their own and others' histories, resources, hopes, and dreams.

In short, community cultural development is a community-building tool that promotes a sense of place, empowerment, and public participation—all key components in the sustainable community development field. Community cultural development and sustainable community development share common values, principals, key elements, and dynamics, and can help inform emerging cultural sustainability models.

Key aspects of community cultural development

• Focuses on arts-based solutions, rather than on identifying problems
• Involves policymakers in CDD planning
• Forms and maintains new social networks
• Develops local orchestras, groups, artists, and government
• Creates and maintains public spaces that draw people together
• Supports multiculturalism
• Integrates local customs, crafts, and practices into education
• Uses arts and culture as a tool for regeneration and sustainability
• Enhances residents' abilities to work and communicate with others
• Builds community identity and pride
• Supports positive community norms, such as cultural understanding and free expression
• Improves human capital, skills, and creative abilities in communities
• Increases opportunities for individuals to become more involved in the arts
• Contributes to the resiliency and sustainability of a community or people
• Reduces delinquency in high-risk youth
• Integrates the community into arts projects
• Fosters trust between community residents
Eco-Arts

Finally, we must acknowledge influences on thinking about the role of culture in sustainability from the field of eco-arts, which can be traced back to the 1960s.

Some artists find inspiration from the environment, while others use art to tackle critical environmental issues. In recent years, relationships between artists and environmentalists have grown stronger, based on their similar values and worldviews toward the preservation and protection of the environment. For instance, there is an increase of creative projects and educational programs that use arts and culture activities to:

- Inform people about environmental issues
- Blend creativity with environmental projects and planning in communities
- Promote a living relationship with the land and living in harmony with nature, inspired by a growing interest in indigenous practices

Eco-arts projects are often collaborations initiated by artists, environmental groups, local musicians, or communities, and they tend to be connected to local concerns over pollution and other specific environmental issues. Artists who are engaged in cultural sustainability often see their creative projects as an environmental practice.

The River was a processional performance created by Karen Jamieson Dance Company together with the Spakwus Silulum Dancers of the Squamish Nation, the Brewery Creek Historical Society, and other community groups. It honoured the layers of history and memory of a now-buried waterway called Brewery Creek in Vancouver.

The River was choreographed in 1998 by Karen Jamieson, and performed by Shinn-Rong Chung, Laura Brema, Allan Dobbs, Caroline Farquhar, Peter Hurst, Hiromoto Ida, Rulan Tangen, the Community Orchestra, and up to 25 volunteers. It began outdoors at the headwater of Brewery Creek in Mountainview Cemetery and ended inside at the Roundhouse Community Centre.

Both cultural sustainability and environmental sustainability...

- Retain and preserve heritage buildings
- Support ecologically sustainable art products and services
- Promote environment-friendly craft products
- Use under-utilized space for arts activity
- Disseminate information on environmental sustainability through arts activities
- Protect Canadian green space and parks
- Inform community residents about environmental issues and problems facing the globe through art
- Foster the development of eco-arts practices
1. The culture of sustainability
This relates to the need for a cultural shift in the way that individuals and society address economic, social, and environmental issues. In this context, the culture of sustainability refers to people changing their behaviour and consumption patterns, and adapting to a more sustainability-conscious lifestyle.

2. Globalization
Culture needs to be protected from globalization and market forces, as many fear that individual communities will lose their cultural identity, traditions, and languages to dominant ideas and culture. In response to these concerns, sustainability discussions focus on education, community development, and locally based policies that are open to change and are consistent with the cultural values of the community. The creation of opportunities to expand and deepen diversity may act as a balance to this.

3. Heritage conservation
This is a common stream in cultural sustainability research, and primarily focuses on three areas:
1. Preserving cultural heritage sites, practices, and infrastructure from outside influences.
2. Cultural tourism. Preserving tangible and intangible cultural heritage ensures that tourism and regional economic development are sustainable over the long term, so future generations may benefit from them.
3. Revitalizing and re-using heritage buildings for cultural facilities. Retaining existing spaces encourages sustainable development and sense of place in communities.

4. Sense of place
Sustainability discussions frequently focus on how culture contributes to a sense of place in communities and cities. Initiatives to enhance sense of place commonly recognize the importance of heritage and symbols, and acknowledge the role of the arts in raising community awareness and interest in sustainability. These strategies also acknowledge the role of the arts can play in resolving conflict between social, environmental, and economic development by providing the creative edge needed to explore multiple perspectives and develop diverse alternatives and options.

5. Indigenous knowledge and traditional practices
Cultural sustainability is linked to the recovery and protection of cultural health, history, and the culture of indigenous knowledge in society. It is linked to previous traditional practices through celebrating local and regional histories and passing down cultural values to future generations. Storytelling is often discussed as a tool to preserve indigenous knowledge and traditional practices through keeping memories alive, celebrating history, offering lessons in effective actions, and even as a means of persuasion in policy debates.

6. Community cultural development
Community cultural development encourages grassroots cultural activists, local organizations, and residents to take an active role in community decision-making, as well as to take ownership over their own community resources and identity. Culture as a development tool increases the level of civic discourse between artists, cultural groups, and community residents by providing opportunities and experiences that inspire, provoke, and facilitate discourse. This creates a collaborative atmosphere in which the arts sector can engage and forge stronger partnerships with others, including government, business, and the broader community, and draw people together who might not otherwise be engaged in constructive social activities.

7. Arts, education, and youth
The arts are seen as both development and communicative tools in communities and schools, as they increase the effectiveness of teaching, research, policy, and actions toward cultural sustainability and development. The arts offer an opportunity to engage in collective, collaborative activities, and enable youth and the community to become more publicly involved and active in political processes. Involving youth in educational programs on cultural, social, environmental, and economic forms of sustainability can help provide them with a more optimistic and sustainable outlook on the future.

8. Sustainable design
Environmentally friendly design that uses recycled materials is a growing influence in sustainable urban, community, and rural planning. Sustainable design is also seen as a component of cultural sustainability—supporting cultural identity can ensure the past is part of the present and will benefit the future.

9. Planning
Planning for sustainable communities recognizes the necessity of cultural capital, but it lacks ideas on how to integrate cultural sustainability. There is a need to show how culture can be integrated into existing community building and development plans. This integration must emerge out of understanding the linkages among the cultural, environmental, economic, and social dimensions of sustainability. In the context of a community’s cultural sustainability, a cultural lens is needed in city planning and design. This requires community culture-based planning strategies that address civic identity, pride, youth, multiculturalism, poverty, and other aspects of communities today.

10. Cultural policy and local government
Cultural and sustainable development policies share the same core aim of improving quality of life for community residents. The multidisciplinary nature of sustainable development requires that policies for sustainability transcend boundaries and integrate culture and other policy areas.
Both community cultural development and sustainable community development ...

- View residents as experts in their community
- Foster common experiences that express a sense of place
- Create and support local policies, development, and economic strategies
- Build self-reliant communities
- Increase community participation and dialogue
- Support and build community infrastructure
- Advise, mentor, and build networks and trust in communities
- Build partnerships with community members and with local government, businesses, and organizations active in the community
- Collaborate with a broad range of partners (for example, housing)
- Encourage residents to take ownership over their own community resources and identity
- Provide experiences for participants to learn technical and interpersonal skills, which are important for collective organizing
- Create public spaces that draw people together who would otherwise not be engaged in constructive social activities
- Support activities and events that create a source of pride for residents and increase their sense of connection with their community
- Increase quality of life in communities
- Engage fellow allies in the community decision-making process
- Provide an experience of getting large groups of people together to spur further collective action in communities

Sustainability is a vision and a process, not an end product.

— Peter Newman & Jeffrey Kenworthy, Sustainability and cities: transitioning economies and societies, 1999

RECOMMENDED READING

Timothy Beatley & Kingsley Manning, The quality of place: Planning for environment, economy, and community, 1997
Brett Swoboda, Making the means of contemporary EcoPDI practice and collaboration, prepared for “Art in environment—a think tank on arts and sustainability”, Vancouver, 2004
Mairi Gilchrist, Cultural policy and urban sustainability: Making a missing link?, Planning Practice and Research, 11(2), 1996
Joe Harkless, “The first pillar of sustainability: Culture’s willingness to take a public planning planning. 2001
Hildgarde Earley, Aesthetics of Sustainability, in Hilde Steenke & Vera David (Eds.), Aesthetics of ecology: Art in environmental design, theory, and practice, 2004

John McLachlan–Gliss Media
Design and Layout
Célyne Gagnon
Writing and Research
Nancy Duxbury, Eileen Gillette, Kaia Pepper
French Translation
Céline Gagnon
Design and Layout
John McLachlan–Gliss Media

Thank you to everyone who contributed information and photos for this publication.

This text is derived from a Centre of Expertise on Culture and Communities working paper, Culture as a Key Dimension of Sustainability: Exploring Concepts, Themes, and Models, February 2007.

The Creative City Network of Canada is a national, charitable non-profit organization that operates as a knowledge-sharing, research, public education, and professional development resource in the field of local cultural policy, planning, and practice.

Staff
Sheryl McGraw
Interim General Manager, Programs and Services
Nancy Duxbury
Director of Research & Centre of Expertise on Culture and Communities
Angela McKinney
Coordinator, Centre of Expertise on Culture and Communities
Sonja Bichsel
Conference & Web Development Coordinator

Take Action: Join the Creative City Network

Become a member of the Creative City Network — help develop national and regional networking and partnerships, and a permanent forum for creative community development in Canada. Celebrate successes, share expertise and experiences, learn from one another ...

Visit creativocity.ca for more information and project profiles